Public Policy and Trade Negotiations

L Alan Winters
Professor of Economics, University of Sussex
Director of UK Trade Policy Observatory
Life is more than just economics

Six correlates of happiness

• GDP per capita,
• healthy years of life expectancy,
• social support,
• trust,
• agency,
• generosity.

Explain 75% of inter-area differences
*World Happiness Report*, 2017
Life is more than just economics

Six correlates of happiness

- GDP per capita,
- healthy years of life expectancy,
- social support,
- trust,
- agency,
- generosity.

Explain 75% of inter-area differences

*World Happiness Report, 2017*
And economics is more than just trade

- Trade policy is an arm of domestic policy
- Trade policy should complement domestic policy
And trade is more than just negotiations

- Some objectives can be wholly unilateral
  - Border formalities
  - Visa regulations
  - Exchange regulations
The problem is that trade negotiations can overflow into other areas.

That is the Brexit critique

‘What started as a trade agreement has spread into other areas’
The issue is trade offs

• You have to know what you want
• And roughly what it is worth to you.
• This is true in the large – e.g. role of markets
• And in the small – do we want less aflotoxin on our peanuts
Where do issues arise?

- Culture
- Privacy
- Public morals
- Standards/regulation
  - Food, animal welfare, environment, prudential, safety (chemicals, motor vehicles)
  - Attitudes to risk (science)
- Income distribution (geographical, functional)
- UK role in the world
Why Trade Agreements?

• Independent short-term maximisation is sub-optimal
  a) Investment in economic (and social) activities needs assurance about the future
  b) Reducing transactions costs needs cooperation

  a) Trade Agreements signal commitment (not easily reversible) between and within parties
     – Tying one’s hands can be good
(b) ‘Shallow’ Trade Agreements

- **GATT**
  - Desist from certain border policies (taxes, quotas)
    - And from internal equivalents to them
  - Simple principles – non-discrimination
  - Forgiving enforcement

→ Little constraint on internal regulation or management of the economy, so long as non-discriminatory
An inexorable dynamic

• Every time a market is made more open, there is
  – More concern about ‘unfair’ competition
    • ‘they’ need similar ‘standards’ to our own
  – More concern if other markets are not open
    • ‘We’ import ‘their’ widgets, ‘they’ must import our ‘banking’

• So more and more policies fall into the international ambit, i.e. to …..
‘Deep’ Trade Agreements

• Deeper liberalisation
• Wider coordination, including regulatory areas
  – ‘Positive’ commitments (to do something)
• Stronger enforcement

• They are more efficient and generate more trade
• But they are much more intrusive
  – More overflow
The uses of Trade Agreements

- Externally:
  - seek concessions from, and assurance about, partners

- Internally:
  - Signal government commitment to a reform
  - Bind a future government to a reform
  - Persuade citizens that a reform will stick
  - Recruit external forces to a domestic agenda
  - Win political objectives before the opposition realises
In an ideal world

• Work out what society wants, commit to it in a Trade Agreement,

• BUT

  – Attitudes change and evolve
  – Regulation is very conservative; it arises from culture, history, accident, …
  – Different interests – across region, income, occupation, sector, …
  – Social objectives are fundamentally a political issue and take time to resolve.

And the UK is in a desperate hurry
The basic requirements for a Trade Agreement

Trust and Time

• Legitimacy of the process (and institutions)
  – Partly matters of tradition and practice
  – Involving recognised interests

• Transparency in the broad
  – What, but also why, how, consequences

• Organised and focussed consultation
Legitimacy of the process

• Parliamentary sovereignty strictly includes
  – Standing Committees, Scrutiny Committees, both Houses, full engagement by ministers
  – Appropriate choice of primary vs secondary legislation

• Role of devolved administrations/assemblies

• An independent source of fact and analysis
  – c.f. Office for Budget Responsibility
(1) Current (non-legislated) plans

- Government publishes outline approach;
  - Parlt. scrutinises and public sees
- Parlt. committees have role during negotiation and can comment;
- Government signs Treaty and implements;
  - Parlt. discusses; can’t accept, reject or amend;
  - Strongest power is to delay ratification (for major issues); secondary legislation – positive or negative
- Parlt. debates and passes primary legislation (for major issues); secondary legislation – positive or negative
- Essentially – how to implement the Treaty (FTA)
(2) Brexit is short-circuiting the process

- Food safety
  - Section 3 of EU Withdrawal Act → ‘retained EU law’
  - Section 8 uses SIs to amend ‘perceived deficiencies’
  - GMOs: Ministers can amend the GMO application and authorisation rules
  - Pesticide residues: Ministers can amend, revoke and make regulations on how active ingredients in pesticides are authorised, and amend the maximum residue levels (‘as appropriate’)

(3) Other process elements

• Devolved administrations
  – ‘responsible for … implementing obligations’ on devolved issues
  – UK will ‘work with …. to secure legislative consent’

• Information
  – Economic analysis at start; impact at the end
  – But on government specifications, assumptions etc.
Transparency in the broad

• To Parliament
  – Prior to negotiations:
    • Outline Approach including scope, negotiating objectives and assessment (but not pre-analysis)
  – During negotiations:
    • Round Report, Annual Trade Report
  – End of negotiations:
    • full treaty text, Explanatory Memorandum, full Impact Assessment.

• But must also engage with public, interested parties
Organised and focussed consultation

• Broad social objectives
  – not just trade
• Analysis of how and why, as well as what
  – trade-offs, broad contours, different approaches
• Engagement with expertise
  – even when it is uncomfortable
• Ask specific questions and make concrete proposals
• July 2018 Consultation – a joke; 600K responses
• STAG – met once so far
Conclusion: Trust and Time

- A national conversation – many forms/fora
- A greater freedom to speak
- Openness to expertise and humbler experts
- More pre-negotiation discussion
- Explicit objectives from government
- Time to debate details

Huge doses of self-restraint and good luck
Thank you

https://blogs.sussex.ac.uk/uktpo/